Appendix:

**Scoring Criteria for the Assessment of Professional Organizations entrusted by Beijing Municipal High People’s Court (Trial)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Assessor | Level 1 indicators | Level 2 indicators | | Level 3 indicators | Scoring criteria | | Data material  (summary of evidence) |
| Judge initiating appraisal and evaluation or litigation service department | Case assessment  (50 points) | Efficiency  (15 points)  (Deduction item) | | 1. Review the entrusted case within the time frame (4 points) | If the professional organization fails to review the case entrusted by the court within the regulated or agreed time frame without any justified reasons, 0.5 point will be deducted for each working day delayed; | | Platform information |
| 2. Notify the party to pay the fees (4 points) | If the professional organization fails to notify the obligor of its payment more than 5 working days after accepting the entrustment, 0.5 point will be deducted for each working day delayed; | | Platform information |
| 3. Complete the entrusted work within the time frame (5 points) | If the professional organization fails to complete the entrusted work within the regulated or agreed time frame, 0.5 point will be deducted for each working day delayed; | | Platform information |
| 4. Upload the electronic appraisal and evaluation report (2 points) | If the professional organization fails to upload the electronic appraisal and evaluation report through the platform more than 5 working days after the completion of the entrustment, 0.5 point will be deducted for each working day delayed. | | Platform information |
| Judge initiating appraisal and evaluation or litigation service department | Case assessment  (50 points) | Quality  (15 points)  (Deduction item) | | 1. Format of procedural documentation (3 points) | If the appraisal opinion or report fails to describe the appraisal and evaluation process in an objective and detailed manner, or makes mistakes of the format or the wording, or makes the records inaccurate, lacks of the professional’s signature or seal, or doesn’t attach the professional’s qualification certificate, 3 points shall be deducted; | | Appraisal and evaluation documentation |
| 2. Application of analysis and reasoning (2 points) | If the appraisal opinion or report is not sufficient in analysis and reasoning, the logical is not clear, the professional language is not standard, or the applicable provisions are not accurate, 2 points will be deducted; | | Appraisal and evaluation documentation |
| 3. The extent of completion of the entrusted matters (5 points) | If the entrusted matters are omitted or exceeded in the appraisal opinion or report, 5 points will be deducted; | | Appraisal and evaluation documentation |
| 4. Objectivity and accuracy of the results (5 points) | If the appraisal opinion or report is considered wrong after re-appraisal or expert argumentation, 5 points will be deducted. | | Appraisal and evaluation documentation |
| Judge initiating appraisal and evaluation or litigation service department | Case assessment  (50 points) | | Management  (10 points)  (Deduction item) | 1. Confidentiality and privacy protection (2 points) | | If the professional organization violates the requirements for personal privacy protection and confidentiality, 2 points will be deducted; | Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| 2. Violation related to receipt of appraisal and evaluation materials (2 points) | | If the professional organization receives the appraisal and evaluation materials at its discretion which submitted by the party concerned without cross-examination or confirmation by the people’s court and uses them as the basis for appraisal and evaluation, 2 points will be deducted; | Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| 3. Storage, use and return of materials (4 points) | | If the appraisal and evaluation materials are not properly kept, used or returned as required, resulting in damages or losses occurred to such materials, 4 points will be deducted; | Correspondence  Work records, etc. |
| 4. Appraisal fee collection and refund (2 points) | | If the relevant fees are not refunded due to the professional organization collects fees in violation of the national or industrial charging standards, the professional organization terminates the appraisal and evaluation work, the people’s court withdraw the entrustment, or the appraisal and evaluation are carried out again due to the appraiser’s lack of relevant qualification, the illegal appraisal procedure, or the insufficient basis of the appraisal opinion, 2 points will be deducted; | Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| Judge initiating appraisal and evaluation or litigation service department | Case assessment (50 points) | | Effect  (10 points)  (Deduction item) | 1. Refusal to accept the court’s entrustment (4 points) | | If the professional organization refuses to accept the court’s entrustment without justified reasons, 4 points will be deducted; | Platform information  Appraisal and evaluation documentation, etc. |
| 2. Evidence collection and inspection do not comply with the provisions (1 point) | | If, without the permission of the people’s court, the professional individual collects evidence, conducts an inquisition on material evidence and the site, or interrogates the party concerned or witnesses, or the implementation procedures of the aforesaid work do not conform to the relevant rules, 1 point will be deducted; | Qualification certificates  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| 3. Failure to comply with court discipline (1 point) | | If the professional individual fails to comply with the court discipline, being negative, or has a bad attitude or performs perfunctory work or occurs other like circumstances when appearing in court, 1 point will be deducted; | Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| 4. Change of written appraisal result (4 points) | | If the professional organization changes the appraisal opinion or report at will without justified reasons through letters, supplementary documents or other means, 4 points will be deducted. | Appraisal and evaluation documentation  Platform information  Work records, etc. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Litigation service departments of intermediate and primary courts | Basic assessment (20 points) | Procedural standardization  (10 points)  (Deduction item) | 1. Case information filling (3 points) | If the professional organization fails to report the progress of the case on the Authorization Platform in a timely and truthful manner, 1-3 points will be deducted as the case may be; | Platform information |
| 2. Issuance of letters according to regulations (3 points) | If the professional organization refuses or delays the issuance of letters due to relevant reasons such as suspension of appraisal and evaluation work, 1-3 points will be deducted as the case may be; | Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| 3. Explanation of reasons by letter (4 points) | If the professional organization fails to fully explain the reasons for dismiss or termination of the appraisal and evaluation work, 1-4 points will be deducted as the case may be. | Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| Work support  (10 points)  (Bonus point item) | 1. Daily delivery and collection of materials (3 points) | If the professional organization regularly goes to the court to collect and deliver the appraisal and evaluation materials that cannot be transmitted online through the Authorization Platform, 1-3 points will be added as the case may be; | Video data  Work records, etc. |
| 2. Professional technical support (3 points) | If the professional organization provides intellectual support to the court by giving knowledge lectures or professional guidance, 1-3 points will be added depending on the quantity and quality of services provided; | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| 3. Innovative measures (2 points) | If the professional organization actively supports the trial execution using information technology and other innovative methods, 1-2 points will be added depending on the effect; | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| 4. Other support (2 points) | If the professional organization provides active support for the court and is highly recognized by the judge or the party concerned, 1-2 points will be added depending on the effect. | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| Litigation Service Office of Beijing Municipal High People’s Court | Comprehensive assessment (30 points) | Information filling  (5 points)  (Deduction item) | 1. Information filling (5 points) | If the professional organization fails to report the changes of its qualification, business scope, qualification and number of its professional individuals through the platform within five working days after such changes occurs, 1-3 points will be deducted as the case may be if the circumstances are minor and no serious consequences have been caused; if serious consequences are caused, 4-5 points will be deducted as the case may be. | Platform information  Correspondence  Work records |
| Complaint handling  (5 points)  (Deduction item) | 2. Complaint handling (5 points) | If the problems or complaints reported by the party concerned or its authorized agent, or the punishments imposed by the administrative authority or the industry associations are considered as minor after verification and do not cause serious consequences, 1-3 points will be deducted as the case may be; if serious consequences are caused, 4-5 points will be deducted as the case may be. | Telephone records  Correspondence  Work records, etc. |
| External evaluation  (10 points)  (Deduction item) | 3. External evaluation (10 points) | Deputies and members, representatives recommended by lawyers’ associations and industry associations, and experts and scholars in relevant fields are invited to conduct an overall assessment and combining the appraisal opinions and reports issued by professional organizations and their overall performance during the whole year. | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| Litigation Service Office of Beijing Municipal High People’s Court | Comprehensive assessment (30 points) | Appraisal cycle  (5 points)  (Bonus point item) | 4. Appraisal cycle (5 points) | If the professional organization completes the appraisal and evaluation works within 15 working days on average, 5 points will be added; 4 points will be added if within 16 to 20 working days; 3 points will be added if within 21 to 30 working days. | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Work records, etc. |
| Active collaboration  (5 points)  (Bonus point item) | 5. Active collaboration (5 points) | If the professional organization is under any of the following circumstances, 1-10 points will be added as the case may be:  i. Being active in activities such as clearing up cases involved in appraisal and evaluation that have not been settled for a long time, case compilation, learning and training, and special lectures;  ii. Effective reduction of the average appraisal and evaluation period in the process of optimizing the business environment according to the laws,  iii. Provide active cooperation in the coordination of major, difficult, complex and sensitive cases and other related work;  iv. Reduction, exemption or postponed payment of appraisal and evaluation fees for the party meeting the requirements for legal aid according to the written instructions of the court;  v. Provide active service for and coordination with the court, and highly recognized by the higher authority, the judge, the party concerned, etc. | Photo news  Audio-visual materials  Platform information  Work records, etc. |
| Litigation Service Office of Beijing Municipal High People’s Court | Annual assessment | Annual assessment score = (total score of case assessment/total number of cases participating in assessment) + (total score of basic assessment/total number of courts participating in assessment) + comprehensive assessment score. | | | |
| Notes: The initial value of the bonus point item is 0, and the maximum score shall not exceed the score of the item. The initial value of the deduction item is the score of this item, and the lowest score shall not less than 0. | | | | | |